

BOROUGH OF FENWICK
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING & PUBLIC HEARING – SEPTEMBER 6, 2023

A Special Meeting and Public Hearing of the Fenwick Historic District Commission was held on Wednesday, September 6, 2023. Notice of the meeting was posted in a timely manner on the Fenwick kiosk, on the website, and in the Harbor News.

Members Present: Deborah Neely, Beverly Keeney, Ashley Gengras (Alternate), JD Rehm (Alternate).

Members Present via Zoom: Mike Reynolds.

Members Absent: Valerie Bulkeley, Patsy Jones.

Others Present: Marilyn Ozols, ZEO and HDC Compliance Official; Brooke Girty, David Savin, Arthur Godbout, Edie Gengras.

Others Present via Zoom: None.

1. Call to order.

Vice Chairman Neely called the meeting to order at 4:00. and appointed A. Gengras and JD Rehm as voting members. A quorum was established (Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm).

2. Public Hearing: Moore Meadow, map 10, lot 1. Borough of Fenwick, owner; David Savin, applicant. Application HDC23-006 to install irrigation and rock with plaque.

M. Ozols stated that the rock covering the meter will be partially buried so will look natural; the existing sprinklers that extend up 3’ will be removed; the new sprinkler heads will extend up 6” and increase to 12” when in use; they should not be visible above the vegetation.

D. Savin stated that they had received a picture of a similar rock and plaque; the rock has been selected by Grove Gardens and will be partially buried; it will look similar to the existing rock and plaque which will remain.

Members discussed the size of the rock.

After asking for public comment and any additional input, **on a motion by B. Keeney seconded by JD Rehm, it was voted unanimously to close the public hearing and go into regular session.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

3. Possible Action on HDC23-006: Moore Meadow.

Based on the discussion in the hearing, **B. Keeney moved to approve the application as presented and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC23-006 Moore Meadow, Nibang Avenue, to install irrigation and a rock with a plaque. JD Rehm seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

On a motion by B. Keeney, seconded by JD Rehm, it was voted unanimously to go back into public hearing.

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.

Against: None.
Abstain: None.

4. Public Hearing: 8 Old Fenwick Road, map 5, lot 106. Fenwick Real Estate Trust, owner; Arthur Godbout, Jr., applicant. Application HDC23-007 to replace shingles with asphalt shingles.

A. Godbout presented. He displayed a sample of the architectural shingle to be installed and stated that it will replace the “slate looking” existing shingle which is brittle and cracking.

Members had no issues.

After asking for public comment and any additional input, **on a motion by B. Keeney seconded by JD Rehm, it was voted unanimously to close the public hearing and go into regular session.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.
Against: None.
Abstain: None.

5. Possible Action on HDC23-007: 8 Old Fenwick Road.

Based on the discussion in the hearing, **B. Keeney moved to approve the application as submitted and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC23-007, 8 Old Fenwick Road, to replace the roof shingles with asphalt shingles. JD Rehm seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.
Against: None.
Abstain: None.

On a motion by B. Keeney, seconded by JD Rehm, it was voted unanimously to go back into public hearing.

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.
Against: None.
Abstain: None.

6. Public Hearing: 10 Pettipaug Avenue, map 10, lot 38. Brooke Girty, owner & applicant. Application HDC23-008 to reconfigure existing structures – south side: relocate front steps & walk, revise existing front porches at 1st & 2nd floors; west side: delete powder room, side landing, & steps, add addition for stairs, new landing & stairs; north side: remove existing detached garage, add new attached garage with attic above, revise driveway; east side: add AC units, remove existing deck & steps, add new first floor master bedroom, add bay, add landing, & steps to bluestone terrace, add living space under front porch roof; remove flat roofed 2nd floor dormer, add shed dormer; window revisions.

B. Girty presented. She reviewed the changes to each elevation utilizing the drawings and the model:

south (front):

- the second floor porch was originally just a gable; the proposal is to remove the porch to return it to a gable but cut it back slightly to better resemble a gable;
- the columns will be returned to regular round columns;
- the first floor porch will be straightened out and extended across the front with a pitch added to the roof;
- the base area behind the hedge will be changed to panel and lattice similar to the Gengras house;
- matching railings will be added around the whole house;
- the existing front door is in the center but the steps go to the side; the steps will be moved to the front;
- there is currently no consistency to the windows; the windows in the bay on the east side will be changed to 6 over 1 which is probably more like what was originally there and the transom windows will be changed to triple pane;

- the tower will remain the same, but the windows will be changed to 6 over 1;

east:

- the side of the front porch and steps, and the pitch of the front porch roof are visible;
- the base of the house will be filled in like the front;
- the second floor porch on the bay will have round columns and railings to match the front porch;
- the windows in the bay and the tower are 6 over 1;
- the second floor flat roof previously pitched down to the first floor; this slant will be returned and a dormer added;
- the lean to roof will be removed to bring the kitchen and master bedroom areas out into the existing deck area;
- a basement mechanical area will be added;
- the rear (north side) shed was not originally attached to the house and the floors are different heights; this will be replaced with a new two story attached garage;
- ac units screened with plantings and an outdoor shower will be added;

north:

- the existing detached garage will be removed and a new two-car attached garage with second floor storage will be added;
- the gravel driveway will be similar to what is there now;
- the new bedroom, deck, shower, and ac on the east side are visible;
- most of the changes, except for the garage, are not noticeable;

west:

- doors to the golf cart bay at the rear of the garage are shown and the side of the new garage is visible;
- a new door with a little porch/landing is added;
- the side wall moves out;
- the front porch is visible;

site plan:

- the driveway and parking area are shown and will remain gravel;
- the existing driveway to Pettipaug Avenue will be changed to gravel but remain in the same location;
- the new 10'x12' bluestone terrace on the east side and new front walkway are shown;
- the footprints for the new construction areas are identified;
- the garage to be removed and the existing tree to remain as of now are shown;
- the landscape/grass area between Agawam Avenue and the parking area increases in size from what is there now;
- the owners will do their own landscaping.

D. Neely noted that the model was very helpful as the 2D elevations make each side of the house look flat; it is much easier to see that this is not the case on the model.

B. Girty stated that they will come back when the light fixtures are selected; that the roof is shown as cedar shingles but they may change to asphalt; and no generator is proposed at the current time.

After asking for public comment and any additional input, **on a motion by B. Keeney, seconded by JD Rehm, it was voted unanimously to close the public hearing and go into regular session.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

7. Possible Action on HDC23-008: 10 Pettipaug Avenue.

Members discussed the possible stipulations.

Based on the discussion in and after the hearing, **B. Keeney moved to approve the application as presented/submitted and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC2-008, 10 Pettipaug Avenue, to reconfigure the existing structures – south side: relocate front steps & walk, revise existing front porches at 1st & 2nd floors; west side: delete powder room, side landing, & steps, add addition for stairs, new landing & stairs; north side: remove existing detached garage, add new attached garage with attic above, revise driveway; east side: add AC units at, remove existing deck & steps, add new first floor master bedroom, add bay, add landing, & steps to bluestone terrace, add living space under front porch roof; remove flat roofed 2nd floor dormer, add shed dormer; window revisions with the stipulations that exterior lighting and any changes from what was presented will require application for a new C of A. JD Rehm seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.
Against: None.
Abstain: None.

B. Girty clarified that the Commission understood that the front porch will be replaced in full, which will require that the existing porch is first removed. Members stated that they understood this.

8. 19 Neponset Avenue, map 11, lot 14. JD Rehm, owner, Brooke Girty, applicant. Modification Application HDC23-009 to remove existing roof deck, add dormer above front door, add AC units at east side of house screened with plantings.

JD Rehm recused himself for this application and assisted in the presentation.

Brooke Girty presented. She identified the changes using the model and the elevations:

- on the north side, the third floor dormer and porch will be removed on the right end; the chimney will remain; these same changes are visible on the west elevation;
- on the Neponset (south) side, a small second floor shed dormer is added;
- on the east side, ac units screened by plantings are added.

Members considered the building changes to be positive and had no issue with the screened ac.

Based on the discussion, **B. Keeney moved to approve the application as presented/submitted and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Modification Application HDC23-009, 19 Neponset Avenue, to remove the existing roof deck, add a dormer above front door, and add AC units at the east side of house screened with plantings. A. Gengras seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras.
Against: None.
Abstain: None.

JD Rehm resumed his seat at this time.

9. Reports on Current Projects.

No reports.

D. Neely will monitor construction at 19 Neponset.

A. Gengras will monitor construction at 10 Pettipaug. B. Keeney will assist when A. Gengras is not in the Borough.

10. Approval of Minutes: July 8, 2023.

B. Keeney moved that the minutes of the previous HDC meeting on July 8, 2023 be accepted as written. A. Gengras seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

For: Neely, Keeney, Reynolds, Gengras, Rehm.
Against: None.

Abstain: None.

11. Old Business / Other Business.

a. 2024 Regular Meeting Schedule.

A draft schedule keeping the same every other month Saturday morning meetings plus an additional Jue meeting was sent to all members. Members agreed to keep the same Saturday morning schedule as in the past.

b. Fee Schedule.

M. Ozols stated that the fee schedule was set based on the cost of the work with the assumption that more expensive projects were more extensive and therefore required more review. For the most part, this holds true. The exception is for a change in material, such as the roof replacement on this meeting's agenda. The project is expensive because of the size of the roof and the cost of materials, but the review is basically the same as it would be for a smaller roof. There are frequent applications for a change in material because of the new more durable, more authentic looking options available. She suggested a set fee if the application is limited to a change in material. Members agreed and considered \$150 appropriate to cover staff and legal notice costs.

M. Ozols also noted that the fee for a modification was set at \$100 to make it easier for people to address an unexpected change that came up during construction. Instead, it's more often the case that incomplete plans are submitted for C of A, with multiple follow up modification applications as details are worked out. This creates confusing files with multiple C of A's and elevation drawings, and requires considerably more staff time that is not covered by the minimal fee. She suggested that the Commission consider increasing this fee.

Members discussed the fact that some applications come in with complete details, but may discover the need for a modification during construction. On the other hand, some applications are clearly incomplete on submission and multiple modification applications are submitted as details are worked out. Members discussed the dilemma of how to set the fee so as to not penalize legitimate modifications that come up during construction but at the same time discourage incomplete initial applications. Various fee amounts were discussed as well as the possibility of setting a maximum for a the number of permitted modifications to the original Certificate of Appropriateness. After this, a full fee would be charged for each modification.

These items will be carried on the agenda for the next meeting for action on a recommendation to the Board of Warden and Burgesses.

12. Adjourn.

On a motion by B. Keeney, seconded by JD Rehm, it was voted unanimously to adjourn at 5:09 p.m.

The next meeting is Saturday, November 4, 2023.

Respectfully submitted,
Marilyn M. Ozols, Acting Clerk