

BOROUGH OF FENWICK

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING & PUBLIC HEARING – MAY 6, 2017

4 NIBANG AVENUE, 9:00 AM

A Regular Meeting and Public Hearing of the Fenwick Historic District Commission was held at 4 Nibang Avenue, Old Saybrook, Connecticut on Saturday, May 6, 2017. Notice of the meeting was posted in a timely manner on the Fenwick kiosk and in the Borough office.

Members Present: Matt Myers, Valerie Bulkeley, Patsy Jones, Joan Wright, David Savin, Deborah Neely (Alternate).

Members Absent: Susan Webster (Alternate), Christine Duncan (Alternate).

Others Present: Marilyn Ozols, ZEO and HDC Compliance Official, Hope Proctor, Frank Gilhool, Frank & Beverly Keeney.

1. Call to order.

Chairman Myers called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. A quorum was established (Myers, Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Savin). In order to accommodate the public, items were taken out of order and the applications for 10 Pettipaug Avenue and 37 Sequassen Avenue were heard before the public hearing.

4. 10 Pettipaug Avenue, map 10, lot 38. J. Girty, K. Gilhool and P. Christensen, owners, Brooke Girty, applicant; Modification Application HDC17-009 to replace windows in bay, porch ceiling light, and shed light, and modify garage doors.

F. Gilhool presented. He reviewed the proposed changes:

- The original C of A for the garage doors included windows, but the current design does not.
- They had originally planned to repair the steps to the front door, but discovered that they were too rotted. The plan now is to add boxes to the ends of the steps similar to the design on a number of other houses. There is no plan to add railings at this time.
- The original intention was to keep the bay window in the living room, but it is rotted and the current application is to replace it.
- The existing porch light will be replaced with a glass box style fixture as in the photo submitted.
- The “shed wall” light will be replaced with a wall lantern as shown.

Members discussed the changes and had no issues. If a railing is needed, the applicant will need to submit an application to modify the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Based on the discussion, **J. Wright moved to approve the application as presented and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC17-009, 10 Pettipaug Avenue, to replace the bay window, porch ceiling light, and shed light, and modify the garage doors and front steps. V. Bulkeley seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Myers, Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Savin.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

6. 37 Sequassen Avenue, map 11, lot 5. David Savin, owner, John MacNeil, applicant; Modification Application HDC17-010 to replace previously approved aluminum trim with Azek.

D. Savin recused himself for this application and D. Neely was seated as a voting member.

D. Savin stated that HDC had approved cladding the trim with aluminum, but the appearance was unsatisfactory. They have now found a way to clad the trim with Azek as they had originally intended. This application is to clad the existing wood trim with Azek to match the trim on the new addition. Members had no issue with this proposal.

Based on the discussion, **V. Bulkeley moved to approve the application as presented and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC17-010, 37 Sequassen Avenue, to wrap the existing trim with Azek. D. Neely seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Myers, Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Neely.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

D. Savin resumed his seat as a voting member at this time.

2. **Public Hearing: 41 Pettipaug Avenue, map 5, lot 122.** Lafayette Keeney, Trustee, owner, Hope Proctor, applicant; Application HDC17-008 to replace windows, deck, and roof; add PVC trim detail, ac & generator, porch addition on south elevation, mudroom addition on east elevation, and stone patio.

H. Proctor presented and reviewed the proposed changes:

- add a small screened porch on the south face and a side mudroom entrance;
- change all of the windows; the current windows have no mullions but the new ones will have vertical mullions across the top; the south facing windows have been enlarged to make the scale match the elevation, except for the window over the proposed porch which is reduced in size because of the porch roof; although not increasing the size of all the windows, they are attempting to improve the look of the front; the new windows will be impact resistant or include permanent pins for plywood covers – pins are currently not shown and will require a modification application if proposed;
- add an Azek trim band around the whole house;
- add diagonal mullions to the large window on the north face to tie into other windows throughout the Borough; the window is too large to replace with a double hung window to match the other windows;
- add lattice in the blank space on the north side where a window cannot be added;
- add mechanicals with evergreen screening next to the front door in the location farthest from the neighbors; members noted that the evergreens will also help to break up the façade but also asked whether the mechanicals could be relocated to the side of the garage which is farther from the easement area; the applicant indicated that this is the proposed location of an underground propane tank which would create a conflict;
- on the east face, add a small entrance and small oval window as well as remove the flat roof between the house and garage;
- add a lattice enclosure to the existing shower on the garage;
- replace light fixtures with styles indicated;
- remove existing deck under bedroom window and add plantings;
- add mullions to the south slider;
- add a stone patio on east side.

Members noted that there was a large expanse between the windows on the west side of the garage. V. Bulkeley suggested adding lattice similar to the front of the house perhaps with an espalier. F. Keeney stated that there is a sidewalk adjacent to the garage wall so plantings are not possible although they could be added on the other side of the sidewalk. P. Jones added that the area is not actually as large as it appears in the drawings. After discussion members and the applicant agreed on plantings on the other side of the sidewalk or a decorative wall lattice at the option of the applicant.

Relative to the porch, H. Proctor stated that the screened porch will be built on-site with pvc trim (e.g. Azek), posts, and rails, and screen panels. The base as well as the shower lattice on the garage will be horizontal slat lattice; the porch slats will be 1x4 and the shower slats 1x6, in the same design. Members discussed the slat design and indicated a preference for “regular” lattice on the base of the porch to tie in better with the traditional design and standard railing.

Relative to the large window on the north face, members indicated that plain glass or vertical mullions might look better than diagonal mullions. H. Proctor expressed the opinion that that might seem more jarring because the proportions are so different. Members also noted the discrepancy in size between the south face windows and other windows, but agreed that the decorative band made this a nonissue. All agreed that the band made a huge improvement in the appearance of the house.

Members discussed proposed stipulations for rectangular mullions in the large north facing window, landscaping or lattice on the west side of the garage, and standard lattice on the base of the porch with the applicant.

After asking for public comment and any additional input, **on a motion by J. Wright seconded by V. Bulkeley, it was voted unanimously to close the public hearing and go into regular session.**

For: Myers, Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Savin.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

3. Possible Action on HDC17-008, 41 Pettipaug Avenue.

In addition to the discussion in the public hearing, V. Bulkeley noted that the proposed location of the mechanicals is in the front of the house, visible from the access easement. Members expressed the opinion that there is adequate screening and the easement use is limited and different from a public road.

Based on the discussion in and following the hearing, **V. Bulkeley moved to approve the application as presented and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC17-008, 41 Pettipaug Avenue, to replace the windows, deck, and roof; add PVC trim detail, ac units and a generator, a porch addition on the south elevation, a mudroom addition on the east elevation, a shower enclosure, lighting fixtures, and a stone patio with the following stipulations:**

- **the diagonal mullions in the large window on the north side shall be replaced with rectangular mullions to match the other windows;**
- **landscaping shall be added on the west side of the garage to address the blank wall between the garage windows;**
- **the horizontal slats on the base of the proposed porch shall be replaced with lattice.**

J. Wright seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

For: Myers, Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Savin.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

5. 12 Neponset Avenue, map 11, lot 8. Martha Staniford & Matthew Myers, owners and applicants; Application HDC17-001 continued portion relative to site grading.

M. Myers recused himself for this application; D. Neely was seated as a voting member and V. Bulkeley acted as chair.

M. Myers stated that the previously approved plan showed a raised flat area south of the terrace. P&Z had reservations about this and the plan now shows a lower flat area which does not involve adding fill. The railroad tie walls that were shown previously have been eliminated; the only item under review at this time is one additional step on the south side of the terrace. The steps were approved previously but one step is being added to reach the lower grade.

Based on the discussion, **J. Wright moved to approve the application as presented and to modify the Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC17-001, 12 Neponset Avenue, to add a step at the rear of the terrace and no landscaping ties. P. Jones seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Savin, Neely.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

M. Myers resumed his seat as a voting member at this time.

7. Approval of Minutes: March 4, 2017.

V. Bulkeley moved that the minutes of the previous HDC meeting on March 4, 2017 be accepted as written. P. Jones seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

For: Myers, Bulkeley, Jones, Wright, Savin.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

8. Old Business / Other Business.

6 and 10 Mohegan Avenue. M. Ozols noted that the owner had been reminded in the fall that if the tents were erected again this summer an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness would be required. Photo documentation of both existing tents has been made. Members noted that the tents are attached to the ground with bolts set in concrete. Members stated for the record that the tents have been erected in violation of HDC Regulations and action is required.

29A Pettipaug Avenue. P. Jones stated that the hydrangea have been planted along the south side wall and these will not provide winter screening. There was also a question regarding the required screening on the west side. M. Ozols will check the Certificate of Appropriateness for required plantings and inspect for compliance.

9. Adjourn.

On a motion by V. Bulkeley, seconded by D. Savin it was voted unanimously to adjourn at 10:05 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Marilyn M. Ozols, Acting Clerk