

BOROUGH OF FENWICK
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING & PUBLIC HEARING – SEPTEMBER 12, 2015
4 NIBANG AVENUE, 9:00 AM

A Regular Meeting and Public Hearing of the Fenwick Historic District Commission was held at 4 Nibang Avenue, Old Saybrook, Connecticut on Saturday, September 12, 2015. Notice of the meeting was posted in a timely manner on the Fenwick kiosk and in the Borough office.

Members Present: Matt Myers, David Savin, Patsy Jones, Joan Wright, Valerie Bulkeley (Alternate), Susan Webster (Alternate).

Members Absent: Honey Adams, Pam Christensen.

Others Present: Marilyn Ozols, ZEO and HDC Compliance Official, Eric Glance, Brooke Girty, Virginia Bush.

1. Call to order.

Chairman Myers called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m. and seated V. Bulkeley as a voting member. A quorum was established (Myers, Savin, Jones, Wright, Bulkeley).

2. Public Hearing: 15 Agawam Avenue, map 10, lot 41. Virginia Bush and Jennifer Evans, owners; CSM Development, applicant; Application HDC15-015 to replace aluminum siding with vinyl clapboard siding and install two ductless ac units.

Eric Glance presented. He stated that the proposal is to replace the existing aluminum siding with smooth finish vinyl siding which will look the same as the current aluminum siding. He indicated that it would be CertainTeed MainStreet brushed finish in colonial white, presented a sample, and noted that there would be a 4" reveal, which is the same as the present siding. He added that the tower will change from vertical to horizontal but the corbels will remain the same; the siding will be either custom made to eliminate seams or installed so that the seams will not be visible from the public way; and aluminum siding is not made for jobs of this size anymore, fades, and, once damaged, cannot be repaired like vinyl can. V. Bush asked about adding shutters to the tower. Members indicated that they would need to see the specific proposal; it could be brought in as a modification at a future meeting. E. Glance stated that he could provide a 3D image for review.

E. Glance stated that they would also prep for future air conditioning so that the ac lines will not be visible and indicated the proposed locations on the photos submitted with the application. The units will be behind the bushes but raised from the ground.

S. Webster arrived during the presentation.

After asking for any additional input and discussing the proposal with the applicant, **on a motion by J. Wright, seconded by V. Bulkeley, it was voted unanimously to close the public hearing and go into regular session.**

For: Myers, Savin, Jones, Wright, Bulkeley.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

3. Possible Action on Application HDC15-015, 15 Agawam Avenue.

J. Wright indicated that this is a legitimate replacement and should be approved. V. Bulkeley concurred and noted that the look is what is important and that will not change.

Based on the discussion in and following the hearing, **V. Bulkeley moved to approve the application as submitted and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC15-015 to replace the aluminum siding with vinyl clapboard siding and install two ductless ac units. D. Savin seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Myers, Savin, Jones, Wright, Bulkeley.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

4. **23 Pettipaug Avenue, map 10, lot 23.** Attilio and Jetta Albani, owners; Brooke Girty Design, applicant; Modification Application HDC15-016 to widen garage and replace single garage door with two smaller doors; remove cupola and bicycle bay on west side; relocate ac units; extend and screen south porch; remove French doors and applied rail on second floor south side and replace with windows; replace stone steps and landing on east elevation with wood.

B. Girty presented. She stated that the changes simplified the features without changing the look and were driven by cost. She pointed out the changes on the elevation drawings noting that on the north side, the bike shed was removed, the garage was widened to 21.5 feet and the cupola was removed; on the west side the ac was relocated so that it was symmetrical to the shower enclosure on the east side when viewed from the front; and on the south side the French doors on the second floor were replaced with windows and the porch screening was extended to the full porch. Members reviewed and discussed the changes.

Based on the discussion, **V. Bulkeley moved to approve the application as submitted and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC15-016 to widen the garage and replace the single garage door with two smaller doors; remove the cupola and bicycle bay on west side; relocate the ac units; extend and screen the south porch; remove the French doors and applied rail on second floor south side and replace them with windows; and replace the stone steps and landing on the east elevation with wood. J. Wright seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.**

For: Myers, Savin, Jones, Wright, Bulkeley.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

5. **29A Pettipaug Avenue, map 10, lot 20-1.** Robert and Ann Pulver, owners; Brooke Girty Design, applicant; HDC15-013 C of A Condition: Redesign of Portion of Wall on North Side; Modification Application HDC15-017 for site modifications to address Planning and Zoning stipulations.

B. Girty presented. She stated that originally they had not proposed gutters and downspouts, but the site plan stipulations increased the size of the gravel trenches such that the plantings would not adequately screen them. Therefore, they are now proposing to add gutters and provide underground infiltration. No rooflines will change. Additionally, in response to the HDC stipulations, a second window matching the kitchen window has been added on the north side and mullions have been added to the French doors on the west elevation. She indicated the locations of the gutters and downspouts on the elevation drawings and stated that they would either be copper or half round white aluminum. Members reviewed and discussed the changes. M. Myers noted that the copper will actually be more visible when it turns green than the white aluminum.

Based on the discussion, **J. Wright moved to approve the applications as submitted and to approve the redesign of a portion of the wall on the north side as stipulated in HDC15-013 and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application HDC15-017 to add gutters and downspouts.**

M. Myers seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

For: Myers, Savin, Jones, Wright, Bulkeley.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

D. Savin requested that in the future elevation drawings without notes be submitted in addition to those with the required notes so that the proposed appearance would be easier to view.

6. **Statutory Approvals:** None.

7. **Administrative Permits:**

a. 15 Pettipaug Avenue (Van Itallie) – in-kind replacement 5 square red cedar shingles.

8. **Approval of minutes: August 5, 2015.**

V. Bulkeley moved that the minutes of the previous HDC meeting on August 5, 2015 be accepted as distributed. P. Jones seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

For: Myers, Savin, Jones, Wright, Bulkeley.

Against: None.

Abstain: None.

9. **Old Business / Other Business.**

a. Birdhouse C of A.

D. Savin stated that, from reading the July meeting minutes at which the structures were approved, the Land Trust or board said the birdhouses were exempt from HDC oversight because HDC didn't have jurisdiction over the design of structures on public property; the Borough could give approval for structures without DC oversight, approval, and control; and if a structure was seasonal/removable (not permanent), HDC again had no oversight or control. He added that it seems that the scenic views that Fenwick homeowners enjoy were totally ignored by the Land Trust when they decided where to place these structures; it seems like the birds are more important than our friends and neighbors; and what the Land Trust did was in total disregard of HDC's powers and HDC's approval was completely wrong and has set a very dangerous precedent!

It was noted that HDC does have jurisdiction over public properties; Borough approval cannot override HDC requirements; HDC has made a policy determination that it will not require Certificates of Appropriateness for seasonal installations; and the letter received from the Havilands specifically addressed the view from the 2nd tee, which is all that the HDC addressed.

V. Bulkeley suggested that it might be appropriate to revisit the policy that exempts seasonal structures. Members agreed and discussed that they have been relatively lenient and therefore things are getting worse. M. Myers reminded members that the reason for the policy on temporary items was that they wanted only to review items that are there for the long term and of the risk that too strict a policy burdens HDC and creates the impression that HDC is watching over everyone's shoulder.

It was noted that all review is in accordance with the Design Criteria and all members should be familiar with that criteria and should review it to be sure it covers everything they'd like to see covered. Members agreed to further discuss the Design Criteria and the seasonal policy at the next meeting and asked M. Ozols to provide information on how other towns handle seasonal structures.

It was also noted that HDC will regularly apply the after-the-fact fee to all applications for work completed prior to HDC approval and that all such applications will be reviewed as if the work had not been done.

b. Proposed Amendments to Regulations.

M. Ozols stated that she had forgotten to include the proposed amendments in the legal notice. They will be scheduled for the next regular meeting on November 7.

c. Proposed 2016 Meeting Schedule.

M. Ozols noted that a draft calendar had been distributed and explained that regular meeting dates must be filed prior to the first of the year and she would like to eliminate any dates that people knew

they would not be available. Members suggested that a doodle be sent and this be discussed at the November meeting.

d. 21 Neponset Avenue.

Discussion was deferred to the November meeting.

10. Adjourn.

On a motion by V. Bulkeley, seconded by D. Savin, it was voted unanimously to adjourn at 10:20 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Marilyn M. Ozols, Acting Clerk